

North Block, New Delhi
Dated the 19th October, 2015

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: - Record Note of the 5th Meeting of National Anomaly Committee (NAC) held on 29th May, 2015 and 9th June, 2015.

The undersigned is directed to forward herewith a copy of the Record Note/Minutes of Anomaly Committee Meetings held on 29th May, 2015 and 9th June, 2015 under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary for information and necessary action.

Encl: As above.

G. Srinivasan
(G. Srinivasan)
Deputy Secretary (JCA)
Telefax No. 23093074

To

All members of the National Anomaly Committee as per list attached.

Copy for information to:-

1. Sr. PPS to Secretary (P)
2. Sr. PS to JS(AV)
3. Secretary, Staff Side, National Council (JCM), 13-C, Ferozshah Road, New Delhi.
4. General Secretary, AIRF, 4 State Entry Road, New Delhi.
5. General Secretary, NFIR, 3, Chemsford Road, New Delhi.
6. PS to JS (Expenditure), Pers., New Delhi
7. Chairman, CDDT, North Block, ND.
8. Chairman, CBEC, North Block, ND.
9. Member, Staff, Railway Board, ND.
10. DDG (SR&M), Dept of Post, Dark Bhanan, ND.
11. Sh. Sharda Prasad DS, Min. of Defence, South Block ND

**RECORD NOTE OF THE 5th NATIONAL ANOMALY COMMITTEE (NAC) MEETING
HELD ON 29TH MAY, 2015**

As per the request of Staff Side to discuss the pending anomalies arising out of 6th CPC, a meeting was held on 29.5.2015, in the Conference Room.72, North Block, New Delhi with the representatives of the Staff Side under the Chairpersonship of Ms. Mamta Kundra, Joint Secretary (Establishment), DoPT. A list of participants who attended the meeting is annexed.

2. At the outset, Shri Ashok Kumar, Director, Central Pay Commission (CPC), welcomed the representatives of the Staff Side and Official Side and expressed his firm belief and conviction that all the issues/demands can be resolved through the consultative processes. He invited Leader and Secretary Staff Side for their opening remarks on the items.

3. Staff Side have requested that all anomalies /issues of 6th CPC may be resolved /settled before the 7th CPC gives its report and there should not be any communication gap between Official Side and Staff Side. The Staff Side expressed its dissatisfaction over infrequent convening of meetings. Secretary, Staff Side also suggested that the next/early date for the meeting also be fixed. They drew attention to the Minutes of the meeting dated 17th & 27th July, 2012 on the MACP issues and wanted to know about the outcome / finality of the issues discussed and whether these are accepted partially or otherwise. Further, as per 6th CPC recommendations, various issues to be decided by the different Ministries / Departments are pending with DoPT/DoE for last several years. Staff Side expressed its anguish on non-resolution of issues and their reference to 7th CPC. They asked for a Status Report in this regard.

The items were then taken up for discussions.

**Item No.1: Review of MACP to Grade Pay of Rs.2000/- where there is no such grade pay in Railways
&**

Item No.3: Treatment of employees selected under LDCE Scheme/GDCE Scheme.

4. Shri M. Raghaviah, Leader of the Staff Side raised **Item No.1** regarding review of MACP to Grade Pay of Rs.2000/- where there is no such grade pay in Railways. He explained that there are 400 categories in the Railways and in 98 percent of the categories, there is no grade pay of Rs.2000/-; therefore, GP of Rs.2000/- does not exist. He said that it was the duty of the Government to resolve the issue before the 7th CPC submit its report. Staff Side requested to solve this serious anomaly as several employees are in disadvantageous position.

5. Staff Side also suggested for the option to continue ACP benefits in lieu of MACP and also requested for five regular promotions. Staff Side also mentioned that there is no cadre restructuring in the MoD.

6. Official Side discussed these issues in detail and impressed upon the Staff Side on the issue related to **Item No.3 i.e. 'treatment of employees for MACP selected under LDCE/GDCE scheme'** that DOPT has already issued a clarification in September, 2012 giving similar treatment of LDCE/ GDCE in MACP scheme as was available in the ACP Scheme. As regards Item No.1, it was reiterated that MACP envisages placement in grade pay structure in the revised pay bands and non-consideration of Grade Pay of Rs.2000/- would not be in the spirit of the scheme. Any change for Railways would have wider ramifications in Government of

India. Staff side desired that this issue may be reviewed since there is a large number of railway staff suffering due to this anomaly otherwise they should be given option for opting MACP or ACP.

Official Side agreed to review this issue.

Item No.2 i.e. Granting of additional pay to Loco and Running Staff.

7. Staff Side raised this issue that since Loco and Traffic Running Staff are uncommon categories, the demand may be considered. The Official Side agreed that Ministry of Finance would revisit the issue; Ministry of Railways was advised to send a fresh proposal in detail after examination, indicating the financial implication involved in the proposal.

Item No.4 regarding Grant of Minimum Entry Pay meant for Direct Recruits to Promotees.

8. With regard to this item, Staff Side expressed its dissatisfaction and stated that the decision was taken in the meeting of NC(JCM) / Standing Committee meeting where it was agreed to implement the same. Now it is being stated that Finance Minister has not agreed as it was not in line with the spirit of JCM scheme. The Staff Side impressed upon the Official Side to take up the proposal again with Finance Minister. The Official Side reiterated its stand that with the new pay structure in position after 6th CPC recommendations, no changes are warranted in the matter. The Staff Side was also informed that stepping up of pay is however continued to be made on a case to case basis where brought to the notice of Finance Ministry. Staff Side insisted that matter should be referred to F.M. again with their earlier agreement.

Official Side informed that as per discussions held in the meeting, the matter will be put up once again to the Finance Minister for decision in the matter.

The meeting ended with the agreement that some more issues/anomalies would be discussed in the next meeting in continuation of this meeting.

RECORD NOTE OF THE 5th NATIONAL ANOMALY COMMITTEE (NAC) MEETING
HELD ON 9TH JUNE, 2015

In continuation of meeting held on 29.05.2015, a meeting of the National Anomaly Committee (NAC) was held on 09.06.2015 at 3:00 PM under the Chairpersonship of Ms. Mamta Kundra, Joint Secretary (Establishment), Deptt. of Personnel & Training in Room No.72, North Block, New Delhi.

2. Shri Asholi Chalai, Director (JCA) welcomed the representatives of the Staff Side & Official Side and invited Leader and Secretary Staff Side for their opening remarks on the items.

3. Leader Staff Side requested for Action Taken Report as agreed upon in the earlier meeting and also enquired on the status of a full time Director, JCM.

4. Leader of Staff Side suggested that a decision regarding Pay fixation under Rule S-13 to the staff who are shouldering higher responsibilities may be taken early. They also questioned the need for the concerned Ministry to send their proposals to Finance Ministry for approvals, when the employees are promoted to same grade pay and when the competent authority could take a decision. The matter may be settled within the Ministry / Department as there has been abnormal delays for more than 2/3 years.

5(a). Leader Staff Side further mentioned that the Departmental Anomaly Committee decision at the Railway Ministries level for merger of Technician GP 2400/- with GP 2800/- allotment of Grade Pay 4600/- to Loco Pilots (Mail/Exp) and grant of additional allowance to all Running Staff. These proposals are pending with the Finance Ministry long.

5(b). He also mentioned that Railway Ministry's proposal for allotment of GP 1800/- to those retired/died between 05.09.2008 and 15.12.2008 is pending with the Ministry of Finance. He said that these former staff are entitled for GP 1800/- as there was no scope for giving them training. He further stated that in this connection, Railway Ministry's proposal may be connected.

The Official Side noted that suggestions of the Staff Side on the issues mentioned in para 5(a) and 5(b) of the Minutes and stated that the proposal of Ministry of Railways pending with the Ministry of Finance will be examined for appropriate course of action.

5(c). Secretary, Staff Side requested that the meeting of National Council (JCM) may be convened at the earliest so that the 10 point of demands, which have already been submitted to the Government may be discussed and resolved.

The Official Side agreed to consider this suggestion.

6. It was also submitted by the Staff Side that pay fixation of Defence personnel who are re-employed in various Ministries / Departments also needs to be finalised along with cadre restructuring proposals of Ministry of Defence and Postal employees.

7(a). Secretary, Staff Side showed concern that inspite of repeated assurances, the anomalies raised by the Staff Side could not be resolved. If these anomalies are not resolved before 7th CPC, the employees will be at a great loss.

7(b). He also mentioned that many proposals from Ministry of Railways for merger of Technician GP 2400/- with GP 2800/- to many railway employees is pending with Ministry of Finance and this issue needs to be resolved at the earliest.

The Official Side noted that the issue of merger of grade pay of technician in Railways was already included in para 5(a) and 5(b) of the Minutes. The specific reference from Ministry of Railways will be examined and readdressed.

7(c). It was also submitted by the Staff Side that pay fixation of Defence Personnel who are re-employed in various Ministries/Departments also needs to be finalised along with cadre restructuring proposals of Ministry of Defence and Postal employees.

7(d). The Staff Side Members of Ministry of Defence raised the following issues:-

- (i) a proposal for granting ACP benefits to the Labourers of Defence Establishment by granting a one time relaxation of Trade Test, since as confirmed by the Department of Expenditure, the post of unskilled and semi skilled has been merged w.e.f. 01.01.2006, the MOD proposal may be approved.
- (ii) MoD proposal for granting 3% increment benefit on promotion of Master craftsman to Charge main in the same GP of Rs. 4200 may be approved.
- (iii) MoD proposal for grant of bunching of increment benefits in the pre-revised pay scale of Master craftsman, pending with DoPT may be approved.
- (iv) MoD's proposal for grant of MACP in GP Rs. 4600/- to those Master Craftsman whose pay scale was upgraded w.e.f. 01.01.2006 be approved.

The Official Side informed that these were not part of the agenda for the meetings held on 29th May and 9th June, 2015 and therefore would be examined separately.

8. Staff side insisted that matter should be referred to F.M. again with their earlier agreement.

Official Side informed that as per discussions held in the meeting, the matter will be put up once again to the Finance Minister for decision in the matter.

9. The discussion held Item-wise were as under:-

Items 1 & 8: Anomaly in the Pay Band/Grade Pay of gazetted officer in pre-revised pay scale of Rs.6500-10500. Maintaining horizontal relativity between the Sections Officers of Central Sectt. and the Income-tax Officers, Superintendents of Post Offices, Superintendents of Central Excise and Customs Deptts.

Staff Side raised issue that the Gr.B Officers in the offices outside the Secretariat in the pre-revised pay scale of Rs.6500-10500 have initially granted the PB-2 with GP of Rs.4200/- subsequently revised to PB-2 with GP of Rs.4600/- without any higher pay scale on completion of 4 years as in the case of Gazetted Officer of CSS/CSSS. The pre-revised pay scales of Assistant Accounts Officer and Section Officers have been merged and granted pay scale of 7500-12000 with GP of Rs.4800/- without providing the higher pay scale of Rs.8000-10500 (PB-3 GP of Rs.5400/-) after completing of 4 years. The parity between the Secretariat Staff and outside Secretariat Services may be resolved.

JS (Pers), Deptt. of Expenditure clarified that there is a specific recommendation of 6th CPC pertaining to Central Secretariat Staff of SOs & PS in Para-3.1.9 of its report and for those relating to staff outside CSS in Para-3.1.14. There is two tier pay structure recommended by 6th

CPC in case of SOs /PS of CSS/CSSS respectively, but the same was not recommended in respect of staff outside the Secretariat.

In the case of SOs and AAOs in the IA & AD and other organised Accounts cadres, the 6th CPC has specifically recommended the GP of Rs.4800/- for both the posts of SOs and AAOs/Audit Officers. However, the Commission did not recommend for granting GP of Rs.5400/- after completion of 4 years.

Superintendent of Post Offices, Income Tax Officers and the Superintendents of Customs & Excise were all in the pay scale of Rs.7500-12000 as on 01.01.2006, and, hence PB-3 is not applicable to them.

It was agreed that this group does not fall within the ambit of JCM being Group 'B' and may be delinked.

Item No.2: Anomaly in the pay scale of Data Processing Assistants Grade –A.

Staff Side said that there is disparity between the pay scale of Data Processing Assistants Grade-A and the Assistant of CSS/Steno Grade 'C' of CSSS, the Staff Side demands to extend the benefits which are available to CSS/CSSS with GP of Rs.4600/- to Data Processing Assistants Grade-A as well.

Official Side maintained that Data Processing Assistants Grade-A were in the pre-revised pay scale of Rs.5500-9000 and not in the pre-revised pay scale of 6500-10500 and therefore granting of GP of Rs.4600/- is not applicable.

Item No.3:- PB-2 with Grade Pay of Rs. 4200/- for Lab Technicians.

The Staff Side demanded for grant of Grade Pay of Rs.4200/- for Lab Technicians working in Ordinance Factory Hospitals against the GP of Rs.2800/-. In this regard, it was clarified that the issue of grant of Grade Pay of Rs.4200/- to Lab Technicians working in Ordinance Factory Hospitals, had already been agreed to from 01-01-2006, subject to the condition that those who were given this Grade Pay, possessed the qualifications as per the Recruitment Rules of 2005.

Item Nos. 4 & 7:- Upgradation of Pay Band and Grade Pay of LDC, UDCs and Stenographers Gr.III in Subordinate Offices & Maintaining the horizontal parity as recommended by the 6th Central Pay Commission.

Staff Side demanded to upgrade Pay Band and granting of Grade Pay of Rs.2800 in PB-I to LDCs to maintain the relativity between Group 'D' and LDCs and Rs.4200/- for UDCs and Steno Gr.III in the Subordinate Offices on the line of GP of Rs.4200/- for Assistants/Steno Gr. Which was upgraded to GP of Rs.4600/-. They further submitted that when a benefit is given to one category of employees, the same may be given to other cadre/subordinate offices.

It was explained that there was a need of amending recruitment rules of Multi-Skilled Staff in the Government Offices who can perform variety of jobs. The 6th CPC recommended that to do away with Group 'D' posts, pay scales in the Govt, the same would stand upgraded to Group 'C' with suitable training. The entry level in the Government is only Group 'C' with 10th class pass qualification. The grade pay of the post of LDC is still higher than that of the minimum entry level in Gr 'C' so there is no anomaly. In view of this recommendation of 6th CPC, the Demand of the Staff Side could not be accepted.

Item No.5 Grant of GP of Rs.4200/- to Senior Clerks of Delhi Milk Scheme.

The Staff Side demanded that the UDCs (10%) of Delhi Milk Scheme (redesignated as Senior Clerks) may be allotted the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 with effect from 01-01-1996 and placed in the pay Band -2 with grade pay of 4200/- w.e.f. 01-01-2006.

Official Side explained that the matter has already been examined in Deptt of Expenditure on receipt of proposal from Ministry of Agriculture but it was not found feasible to accept as per recommendations of 6th CPC. The Sr. Clerks have meanwhile filed two OAs in CAT and the matter is subjudice.

Item No-6 Removal of anomaly in the case of Artisan staff of different Departments.

The Staff Side requested for allowing notional pay fixation in respect of Artisans of MMS of D/o Posts. The Fourth CPC pay scales for skilled Artisan Grade II was Rs.1200-1800 and Grade-I was Rs 1320-2040. Fifth CPC clubbed both the scales of pay of Artisans to one pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000. Since it was promoted post for Artisan Staff, they stated that both the scale of pay was not justified and needs to be rectified in r/o Artisans staff of Railway and Defence with Rs. 4000-6000 for Grade-II &Rs. 4500-7000 for Grade-I. Presently, pay scales to Artisans staff of MMS in D/O Post, numbering about 168 were discriminated and were placed in combined pay scales of Rs.4000-6000. Therefore, Staff Side requested for allowing notional pay fixation in respect of Artisans of MMS of Deptt. of Posts, in the pre-revised scale of Rs. 4500-7000 w.e.f. 01-01-1996.

It was stated by Official Side that if a post is upgraded as per the recommendations of 6th CPC, the fixation of pay in the applicable band will be done by multiplying the existing basic and is regulated by Note 2A of Rule-7 of the CCS (RP) Rules, 2008. Accordingly, where a post has been upgraded as a result of 6th CPC's Recommendations, the fixation of pay drawn by the employees as on 01-1-2006 by a factor of 1.86 and the grade pay corresponding to the upgraded scale will be payable in addition. Therefore, it not possible to deviate from the provisions of CCS (RP) Rules, 2008. However, Deptt. Of Expenditure stated that there seems to be a requirement to revise the Recruitment Rules and therefore, Department of Post has been advised to look into the matter taking into account the RRs. Staff Side agreed on this and requested to convene a meeting with them as and when issue is settled.

Item No.9:- Pay Band and Grade Pay for Medical Assistant of Ordinance Factories.

Staff Side demanded the Medical Assistants of Ordinance Factories are getting a grade pay of Rs.1800/- only, where Dresser in Indian Railway Hospitals which have similar duties were placed in the Grade pay of Rs. 2000/- in the pay scale of Rs. 3200/-. They demanded that Medical Assistants may be placed in PB-1 (GP-2400) (old pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000). They may also be provided with uniform as per with Nurses and granted nursing allowance of Rs.3200/- pm and washing allowance of Rs.600/- pm.

Official Side mentioned that the proposal to enhance the GP of Rs.1900/- for Medical Assistants was sent to Ministry of Finance on 15.10.2014, but there was no case for review. Both the Staff Side and Official Side agreed that this matter may be sent to 7th CPC for comparing various cadres.

Item No.10: Store Keeping Staff

Staff Side stated that there is no uniformity in the matter of designation and pay scales in Department of Defence in comparison with the Store staff working under the Indian Railways. The storekeeping staff, through CDRA submitted a Memorandum to the 6th CPC requesting to remove this disparity in comparison with those working under the Railways enclosing duties/responsibilities of both the Departments but the anomaly has not been rectified. Therefore, Staff Side have demanded to remove/rectify this anomaly in pay of Store staff working under MoD in comparison with Min of Railways.

Official Side informed that the matter stands referred to 7th CPC with the recommendation that the issue of parity in the pay structure of common categories of store keeping staff may be considered particularly in view of the fact that the educational qualification of the store keeping staff in Ministry of Defence has also been revised to Graduate in any discipline or Diploma in Engineering in any discipline or Diploma in Materials Management.

Item No.11: Children Education Allowance - Denial thereof.

Staff Side stated that Reimbursement of Children Education Allowance is admissible for two eldest children studying in schools affiliated to Board Education. This was stated to be contrary to the spirit and letters of the recommendation of the VI CPC. Therefore, Staff Side demanded that the allowance be made admissible to any two school going children and also that for the children studying in nursery primary and middle class level, affiliation to any Education Board may not be insisted upon.

Official Side stated that reimbursement of CEA is a welfare measure extended by the Govt. of India to its employees children studying in recognised schools. Government has taken a considerate view under National Population Policy and RTE. Therefore, this issue is not an anomaly.

Item No.12: Note on Master Craftsman in MMS under Department of Posts for discussion in the Fast Track Committee.

Staff Side raised demand that the Charge Hand cadre in Department of Posts should have been placed identical with the Technical Supervisors instead of Artisan Grade-1 for the reasons that the Charge hand is the promotional cadre for Artisan Grade-1 who practically supervises that work of all other Artisans Grade-I, II, III. The knowledge and technical know how required for the Charge hand is very high because of the new technology entered is servicing the modern motor vehicles. Therefore, Staff Side stated that there should be absolute parity with the same cadre of Railways and Defence departments.

It was decided that matter may be sent to 7th CPC as it should be examined on cadre to cadre basis.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

List of Participants who attended the Meeting of the National Anomaly Committee held on 9.06.2015

CHAIRPERSON

**Ms Mamta Kundra
Joint Secretary (Establishment)**

OFFICIAL SIDE	STAFF SIDE
Ms A.G. Mathew, JS(Pers) Department of Expenditure	Shri M.Raghavaiah, Leader
Shri Mohan Lal, Director (DD)	Shri S.G.Mishra, Secretary
Shri A.K.Qasim, DS, CBEC	Shri Guman Singh, Member
Smt Neera Khuntia, Railway Board	Shri R.P. Bhatnagar, Member
Shri Vikram Gulati, DPCII, Railway Board	Shri C.Srikumar, Member
Smt Mukta Goel, Director, DoPT	Shri M.S.Raja, Member
Shri Arun Malik, Director(SR) D/o Posts	Shri R. Srinivasan, Member
Shri Surender Kumar, ADG(PC Cell) D/o Posts	Shri Rakhal Das Gupta, Member
Shri Sharda Prasad, Dy. Secy. Department of Defence Production	Shri J.R. Bhosle, Member
Shri Manmohan Pipil, DS(CP) D/o Defence	Shri K.K.N.Kutty, Member
Shri A.K.Jain, DS(Pay), DoPT	
Shri Pushpender Kumar, US(Pay), DoPT	